

# A Comparative Study of Content and Language: Feasibility of Class IV Indonesian Language Textbooks

**Benedicta Monica Anindya Putri<sup>1</sup>, Ida Zulaeha<sup>2</sup>, Panca Dewi Purwati<sup>3</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Master Program, Student of Primary Education, <sup>2,3</sup>Master Program, of Primary Education;  
Semarang State University, Semarang City, Indonesia.

Corresponding Author: Benedicta Monica Anindya Putri

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.52403/ijrr.20240130>

## ABSTRACT

Books are an important tool in efforts to improve the quality of education. Through this textbook, students can obtain knowledge and information other than from a teacher. Therefore, teachers must intelligently determine the textbooks that will be used in learning because the choice of the best textbook will have a big influence on the learning process. Good textbooks have certain criteria or standards. Based on the results of the interview, information was obtained that the large number of Indonesian language textbooks in circulation created problems in choosing them. The diversity of authors and publishers gives rise to the diversity of the book's quality. Of course, there are still shortcomings, including textbooks that do not match the curriculum message; there are textbooks that contain material that is only in the form of a summary and less relevant to the learning outcomes that have been determined. The research method used by researchers is a comparative-qualitative method. Comparative research is research that compares the existence of one or more variables in two or more different samples. The research instrument examines the suitability of content and language using the 2022 BSNP (National Education Standards Board) instrument and adds indicators according to the theory used as the basis for the research. Data validity testing is carried out to determine the accuracy of the reported data. The technique used is the Miles and Huberman model of qualitative data analysis techniques. The results of this research are the appropriateness of the content in the class IV

Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida. The criteria for completeness of material, criteria for depth of material, criteria for accuracy in selecting material, criteria for accuracy in concepts and theories, criteria for accuracy in selecting examples, the criteria for accuracy in training, the criteria for conformity with scientific developments, the criteria for suitability of features, examples, exercises/references, the criteria for developing insight into diversity, and the criteria for developing insight into nationality and national integration are categorized as very good. The suitability of the language in the class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida, based on the criteria of suitability to the level of intellectual development of students and the criteria of suitability to the level of social and emotional development of students, is categorized as very good.

**Keywords:** Comparative, Content Appropriateness, Language Appropriateness, Textbooks

## INTRODUCTION

Education is one of the main benchmarks for a nation's progress. Another government effort can be seen in Law Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System. This law is able to guarantee improvements in the quality of education at this time, and one of the efforts made is improving the quality of learning. Learning is a process of interaction between students

and teachers in a learning environment. Government Regulation Number 19 of 2005, Article 19, Paragraph 1, states that it provides sufficient space for initiative, creativity, and independence in accordance with students' talents, interests, and physical and psychological development. The learning process in educational units is carried out in an interactive, inspiring, fun, and challenging manner, motivating students to participate actively as well as books are an important tool in efforts to improve the quality of education. Textbooks are important and functional books for students. Through this textbook, students can obtain knowledge and information other than from a teacher. Textbooks provide detailed and clear descriptions of subjects according to the field of study; textbooks can even provide neatly arranged study materials and provide questions as evaluation material for students. Apart from that, textbooks can also make students motivated to learn. With a textbook, students are guided to practice, practice, or try out the theories they have learned from the book. Therefore, teachers must intelligently determine the textbooks that will be used in learning because the choice of the best textbook will have a big influence on the learning process. A good textbook has certain criteria or standards, such as its relevance to the current curriculum, the suitability of the method to the material presented, the content of the book, or its scientific angle. Analysis of the suitability of textbooks is based on suitability of content and suitability of language. The content appropriateness assessment includes the substance or material contained in the textbook. Language appropriateness includes the use of language in textbooks. If a textbook meets all the requirements for assessing the content and language of a textbook, then it can be said that the textbook is suitable for use to support learning, of course, while still paying attention to other elements of suitability.

Based on the results of interviews with class IV B teachers, information was obtained that the large number of Indonesian language textbooks in circulation created problems in selecting them. The diversity of authors and publishers gives rise to the diversity of the book's quality. Of course, there are still shortcomings, including textbooks that do not match the curriculum message; there are textbooks that contain material that is only in the form of a summary and less relevant to the learning outcomes that have been determined. This needs to be paid attention to when choosing the best book. Having textbooks can help students and teachers more easily search for and find learning materials, which are expected to provide facilities for students to achieve the competencies set by the curriculum. It is hoped that it will be easier for students to achieve the learning competencies that have been determined, so that it will be easier and faster for them to complete and continue their education. Regarding the issue of school books, the government, through the National Education Standards Agency (BSNP), controls books by means of evaluation. The aim of assessing textbooks is to provide textbooks that are suitable for use to improve the quality of national education, improve the quality of Indonesia's book resources, protect students from poor-quality books, and increase interest and enjoyment in reading. According to BSNP (Pulungan, 2020), quality textbooks must fulfill four elements of suitability: suitability of content, suitability of presentation, suitability of language, and suitability of graphics. Based on this phenomenon, researchers want to examine the suitability of the content and language of the class IV Indonesian language textbooks currently used in learning. The researcher formulated the problem, namely, how appropriate are the content and language of the class IV Indonesian language book published by Erlangga? The researcher chose the Indonesian language textbook published by Erlangga and Yudhistira as the book to be

analyzed because this book refers to the independent curriculum, meaning that books with the new curriculum are rarely published, so it is necessary to know the quality of the book.

### **LITERATURE REVIEW**

According to Grenee and Petty (Pulungan, 2020), quality textbooks have ten categories, namely:

1. Textbooks must attract students who use them
2. Textbooks must provide motivation to the students who use them.
3. Textbooks must contain illustrations that attract the attention of students who use them.
4. Textbooks should consider linguistic aspects so that they suit the abilities of the students who use them
5. The contents of the textbook must be closely related to other lessons; it is even better if you can support it with a plan so that everything forms a complete and integrated whole
6. Textbooks must be able to stimulate the personal activities of students who use them
7. The textbook must consciously and firmly avoid vague and unusual concepts so as not to confuse the students who use it
8. The book must have a clear and firm point of view
9. Textbooks must be able to provide consolidation and emphasize the values of children and adults
10. Textbooks must be able to respect the personal differences of the students who use them. Literature review should be written here with proper citation.

If we examine in more depth the criteria proposed by Grenee and Petty above, ten points can be identified that are used as benchmarks in determining the quality of book texts. These items include interest, motivation, illustration, linguistics, integration, activation, activity, clarity of concepts, point of view, strengthening

values, and respecting personal differences. Textbooks are closely related to the applicable curriculum. A good textbook must be relevant and support the implementation of the curriculum. Linguistic criteria refer to the aim of ensuring that the text of the book is understood by students. Therefore, the author changed the term to communicative. Regarding textbook assessment, the National Education Standards Agency (BSNP) has developed a textbook assessment instrument. This instrument is used to determine the suitability of a textbook to be categorized as a standard educational book. A quality textbook must fulfill four elements of eligibility. The four elements of appropriateness are: (1) appropriateness of content; (2) appropriateness of presentation; (3) appropriateness of language; and (4) appropriateness of graphics. These four feasibility studies are described in the form of indicators that are detailed enough so that anyone can apply them. For textbook evaluators, this instrument is used as a basis for determining whether a textbook is suitable as a standard book. For textbook writers, this instrument can be used as a basis for developing or writing textbooks so that the results do not deviate from BSNP expectations. For teachers and the general public, this instrument can be used for learning purposes at certain educational unit levels. Content feasibility is divided into several subcomponents with more detailed indicators, among others:

1. Flow of Learning Objectives (ATP) and materials representing Learning Achievements (CP); the depth of the material is appropriate to the learning objectives
2. Learning assessments can measure the achievement of learning objectives
3. Scientific material is described validly and accurately in accordance with what is applicable in the field of science. with indicators including, a) suitability with developments in science and technology, b) up-to-date features, c)

examples and references, d) reasoning, e) problem solving, f) relationship between concepts, g) application application, h) attractiveness of the material, i) encouragement to seek further information, j) enrichment material

4. The information in the material is in accordance with real life and events (real life)
5. Materials, examples, illustrations, and activities support the development of Pancasila student profile values.

Linguistic feasibility is divided into several subcomponents with more detailed indicators, among others:

1. The language used is in accordance with the development of students' thinking, with indicators including message readability (communicative), ability to motivate students, encourage critical thinking, suitability to the level of intellectual development of students, and suitability to the level of social and emotional development of students
2. The language used is good, correct, and easy to understand, with indicators including the effectiveness of sentences, the use of correct spelling according to PUEBI, and consistency in the use of terms, symbols, or icons.

## **MATERIALS & METHODS**

The research method used by researchers is a comparative qualitative method with a qualitative approach. Comparative research is research that compares the existence of one or more variables in two or more different samples (Sugiyono, 2012: 57). The focus of this research is to examine the appropriateness of the content and language of the class IV Indonesian language textbook published by Erlangga by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida. Compare the quality of which is better between the two books. This research data is a pattern of content and language studies. The data source for this research is the class IV Indonesian language textbook. The techniques that will be used to collect data

in this research are listening, sorting, and note-taking. The listening technique is used to understand the entire contents of the book. The sorting technique was carried out to sort out all aspects of reading relating to the study of content, language, and presentation patterns in class IV Indonesian language textbooks. The note-taking technique is presented to record the quality analysis of the appropriateness of the study of the content and language of the two books. The research instrument examines the suitability of content and language using the 2022 BSNP (National Education Standards Board) instrument and adds indicators according to the theory used as the basis for the research. Data validity testing is carried out to determine the accuracy of the reported data. Testing the validity of data in qualitative research is carried out using credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability tests (Sugiyono, 2012). The technique used is the Miles and Huberman model of qualitative data analysis techniques. The following are the stages of qualitative data analysis techniques using the Miles and Huberman model (Sugiyono, 2020, pp. 321–330).

## **RESULT and DISCUSSION**

The first book analyzed was the Language Textbook for Elementary/MI Class IV, published by Erlangga by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida. This book contains eight chapters, divided into two semesters. Each semester consists of four chapters. Each chapter consists of three to four subchapters.

### **1. Appropriateness of Content**

The suitability of the contents of the textbook (BUKU) entitled Indonesian Language Competency 1 for SD/MI Class IV by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is categorized as very good. The aspects studied are as follows:

#### **a. Depth of material**

The material in the class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is in-depth. Material

that is considered lacking is found in chapters I, IV, V, and VII. The material presented should also be about how students find difficult words in the dictionary. Apart from that, there is no discourse. In fact, the depth of the material should be explained by the suitability, quantity, and quality of the discourse. Therefore, after being presented with the lesson material, students are then given a discourse that can be used as a task to look for difficult words in the discourse.

b. Accuracy in material selection

In the aspect of accuracy in selecting material, materials that are considered less accurate in selecting material are found in chapters I, II, and IV. This chapter is considered less accurate in selecting material because the material presented is no longer being discussed (actually), some do not mention clear sources, and are not appropriate to the level of development and understanding of students. Examples of discourse that is not appropriate to the level of development and understanding of students. In chapter I, the discourse presented is not appropriate to the level of development and understanding of students. The discourse above containing the Bali bombing can cause trauma to students who have experienced this incident. So it is better if the discourse presented is in accordance with the students' level of understanding and psychology.

c. Accuracy in concepts and theories

In the aspect of accuracy in concepts and theory, the class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is accurate in concepts and theory. Material that is considered lacking in concepts and theory is found in Chapter IV. The material is considered less accurate in terms of concepts and theories because the concepts and theories presented to achieve learning outcomes and learning objectives are not in accordance with the

scientific field (do not give rise to many interpretations).

d. Accuracy in sample selection

In the class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida, it is accurate in selecting examples. Material that is considered less accurate in selecting examples is found in chapters I, VI, and VII. The selection of examples is considered inappropriate because the examples presented do not match the psychological level of students and do not contain moral values such as example, honesty, responsibility, discipline, cooperation, and tolerance. In chapter IV, it can be seen above that the examples of short stories presented are not appropriate. The examples presented should contain superior moral values such as example, honesty, responsibility, discipline, cooperation, and tolerance. The example above does have moral values but is not suitable for class IV students because the short story above contains information about domestic life. Students should be presented with examples of short stories about friendship.

e. Accuracy in training

The class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is accurate in selecting training. Material that is considered less accurate in choosing training is in Chapter I. The training is considered inappropriate because it does not start with simple concepts and then progress to complex ones, from concrete to abstract, easy to difficult, according to the principles of the learning process. After students are given the exercise above, they should be presented with a discourse, and then they will look for difficult words in the discourse. So that training for students starts from easy to difficult according to the learning process.

f. Conformity with developments in science

The class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is in accordance with scientific developments. Material that is considered less appropriate to developments in science is found in Chapter I because the material presented in the book is not up-to-date and not in accordance with developments in science, technology, and the arts (science and technology) that are relevant to students' level of cognition.

- g. suitability of features, examples, exercises/references

The class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida has appropriate features, examples, exercises/references. Material that is considered inappropriate for features, examples, exercises/references is contained in chapters I, II, III, VI, VII, and VIII. The material in the chapters mentioned above is considered less suitable for features, examples, and references because the discourse and development can show features, examples, pictures, or illustrations that reflect real events or happenings, preferably up-to-date ones that can be seen and experienced by students in everyday life. Development of diversity insight.

- h. Development of diversity insight

The class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is appropriate for developing diversity insight. Material that is considered less suitable for developing insight into diversity is contained in chapters V, VI, and VII. The material above is considered to develop diversity insight due to a lack of appreciation for cultural and religious diversity, a lack of appreciation for the progress of society, a lack of appreciation for products and services, and a lack of appreciation for the potential of cultural and natural wealth.

- i. Development of national insight and national integration

The class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is in accordance with the development of national insight and national integration. Material that is considered less suitable for developing national insight and national integration is contained in chapters VI and VII. The materials above are considered not to develop national insight and national integration because the discourse and development do not promote love of the homeland and do not strengthen the sense of national unity and integrity. The following is an example of material that is less accurate in developing national insight and national integration in Chapter VI.

## **2. Language Eligibility**

The language suitability of the Indonesian language textbook for SD/MI Class IV by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida is categorized as very good. Suitability to the level of intellectual development of students. Covers several aspects, namely: a) readability of the message (communicative); b) ability to motivate students; c) encouraging critical thinking; d) suitability to the level of intellectual development of students; e) conformity to the level of social and emotional development of students; f) effectiveness of sentences; g) use of correct spelling according to PUEBI; and i) consistency in the use of terms, symbols, or icons. The presentation of material in accordance with the poor level of intellectual development of students is found in chapters I, III, and V. Other aspects of language appropriateness are good.

## **CONCLUSION**

From the results of this research, it can be concluded as follows:

1. The suitability of the content in the class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida, the criteria for completeness of material is categorized as very good, the criteria for

depth of material are categorized as very good, the criteria for accuracy in selecting material are categorized as very good, the criteria for accuracy in concepts and theories categorized as very good, criteria for accuracy in selecting examples categorized as very good, criteria for accuracy in training categorized as very good, criteria for suitability with scientific developments categorized as very good, criteria for suitability of features/examples/exercises/references categorized as very good, criteria for developing insight into diversity categorized as very good, and the criteria for developing national insight and national integration are categorized as very good

2. The suitability of the language in the class IV Indonesian language textbook by A. Indradi and Rahmah Purwahida, according to the criteria of suitability to the level of intellectual development of students, is categorized as very good, and the criteria for suitability to the level of social and emotional development of students is categorized as very good.

Conclude your research paper here.

### **Declaration by Authors**

**Acknowledgement:** None

**Source of Funding:** None

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

### **REFERENCES**

1. Sahrul Asri. (2017). Telaah Buku Teks Pegangan Guru Dan Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Kelas VII Berbasis Kurikulum 2013. *RETORIKA: Jurnal Ilmu Bahasa*, 3(1), 70–82.
2. Abdullah, S. (2022). Analisis Kelayakan Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia untuk Siswa Kelas VIII Sekolah Menengah Pertama. *DIGLOSIA: Jurnal Kajian Bahasa, Sastra, Dan Pengajarannya*, 5(3), 707–714.
3. Apriliana, O. Y. (2017). Analisis Kelayakan Isi Dan Bahasa Buku Teks Siswa Bahasa Indonesia Kurikulum 2013 Kelas VII SMP / MTS Terbitan Kementerian Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan Ri Edisi Revisi Tahun 2017 The Analysis of Content and Language Feasibility Text Book Students Bahasa Indo. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia*, 2.
4. BILJANA B. RADIĆ-BOJANIĆ, J. P. T. (2016). Textbooks In the Efl Classroom: Defining, Assessing and Analyzing 3. *Collection Of Papers of The Faculty Of Philosophy*, 178002, 137–153.
5. Damai, A., Krissandi, S., Widharyanto, B., & Dewi, R. P. (2017). Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia untuk SD Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia untuk SD.
6. Devitta, K. E. B., Dan, E., & M, S. I. (2022). Analisis Kelayakan Isi Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia. *Literat: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia*, 1 (1), 1–13.
7. Ernawati, Y. (2018). Telaah Buku Teks Tematik Terpadu Kelas IV SD Kurikulum 2013. *BINAEDUKASI*, 11(2), 109–123.
8. Gustiar, A. W., Saepurokhman, A., Irianto, A., & Artikel, I. (2023). Analisis Kelayakan Isi Dan Penggunaan Bahasa Dalam Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia Kelas IX SMP Karya Agus Trianto, Dkk. Sebagai Upaya Pemilihan Bahan Ajar Bermutu. *Literat: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia*, II (1), 62–70.
9. Hafid, A. (2021). Studi Komparatif Hasil Belajar Bahasa Indonesia Secara Luring Dengan Daring Siswa Kelas V SD GugusII. *JIKAP PGSD: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Kependidikan*, 5, 416–422.
10. Hanna Zalfa Mulyawati1, H. F. S. (2022). Telaah Kualitas Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia Pada Materi Berita Kelas VIII SMP. *TAKLIMUNA: Journal of Education and Teaching*, 1(2), 13–22.
11. Julrissani. (2020). Karakteristik Perkembangan Bahasa Dalam berkomunikasi siswa Sekolah Dasardi Sd Muhammadiyahkarangbendo Yogyakarta. *EDUMASPUL: JURNAL PENDIDIKAN*, 4(1), 72–87.
12. Murdaningsih, S., & Murtiyasa, B. (2016). An Analysis on Eight Grade Mathematics Textbook of New Indonesian Curriculum ( K-13 ) Based on Pisa ' s Framework. *JRAMathEdu: Journal of Research and Advances in Mathematics Education*, 1(1), 14–27.
13. Nugroho, E. D. (2017). Analisis isi, penyajian materi dan keterbacaan dalam

- buku teks ipa kurikulum 2013 smp kelas vii semester 1. JURNAL PENDIDIKAN BIOLOGI INDONESIA, 3, 114–122. <https://doi.org/10.22219/jpbi.v3i2.3904>
14. Pulungan, R. (2020). Telaah kurikulum dan buku teks bahasa indonesia (Issue September).
  15. Puspita, T. A., & Rohmatin, N. (2022). Kelayakan Buku Bahasa Indonesia Sma Sederajat Kelas X Edisi Revisi 2017 Terbitan Kemdikbud. BELAJAR BAHASA: Jurnal Ilmiah Program Studi Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia, 2, 17–25.
  16. Siringo-ringo, A., & Pangaribuan, T. R. (2021). Telaah Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia SMA Kelas XI Kurikulum 2013 Edisi Revisi 2017 Terbitan Kemdikbud. KODE: Jurnal Bahasa, 11, 21–29.
  17. Wardhani, F. P., Islamiyah, H. Y., Zulfadilla, I., Mukhlis, M., & Riau, U. I. (2022). Analisis Kelayakan Penyajian Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia Kelas XI Kurikulum 2013 Edisi Revisi 2017. SAJAK Sastra, Bahasa, Dan Pembelajaran Bahasa Dan Sastra, 1, 156–167.
  18. Wilkens, H. J. (2011). Textbook approval systems and the Program for International Assessment (PISA) results: A preliminary analysis. IARTEM E-Journal, 4(2), 63–74.
  19. Wulandari, G., Indriani, M. S., & Nurjaya, G. (2021). Analisis Kelayakan Isi Materi Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia Kelas XII Terbitan Kemdikbud Edisi Revisi 2018 Feasibility Analysis of the Contents of Indonesian Language Textbook for Class XII Published by the Ministry of Education and Culture, Revised Edition. Journal of Digital Learning and Education, 01(3), 141–149. <https://doi.org/10.52562/jdle.v1i3.254>
  20. Yusuf Hendrawanto. (2017). Kelayakan Buku Teks Bahasa Indonesia SMA/SMK: Analisis Kebahasaan, Isi, Penyajian, Kegrafikan, Dan Keterbacaan.
- How to cite this article: Benedicta Monica Anindya Putri, Ida Zulaeha, Panca Dewi Purwati. A comparative study of content and language: feasibility of class IV Indonesian language textbooks. *International Journal of Research and Review*. 2024; 11(1): 284-291. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.52403/ijrr.20240130>

\*\*\*\*\*